

## Deconstructing Synthetic Biology – Biotechnology Case Studies Across Scales

## Assignment 2: Deconstruct a synthetic biology technology – Part 2

Assessment: Graded (35% of the total Homework grade, 10% of the total Participation grade).

<u>Prompt:</u> In a previous assignment you picked a synthetic biology technology and deconstructed it into the biological functions needed. Now let's revisit this technology and use the scales framework we discussed in class to deconstruct it. In a Word document or PowerPoint, answer the following:

- 1. What are the biological functions within the molecular, network, cell/cell-free systems, and cellular 'communities' scales needed for this technology?
- 2. Identify and discuss at least <u>three</u> separate challenges that arise at the interface of these scales.
- 3. What about the societal scale are there any ethical or societal challenges that arise when thinking about developing or deploying this technology?

Then, prepare a brief presentation (~3 minutes) and be prepared to present in class (see below for detailed instructions). While we would like you to revisit the technology you analyzed in your previous assignment, you may choose a different technology if you feel strongly about doing so. Note – you must choose different technologies than bacterial nitrogen fixation or PRIME editing since we discussed these in detail in class.

<u>Reflection</u>: Comparing to your previous assignment, what do you now know about deconstructing synthetic biology solutions 'along scales'? How has your thinking changed/developed? Include a brief response in your turned in assignment (~1 paragraph; not in your class presentation). The reflection is not graded, but will go towards your participation grade (2.5%).

<u>Submission:</u> Please turn in your assignment - Word Doc and PowerPoint slide deck - with electronic files at least <u>1 hour</u> before the beginning of class. The Word Document assignment should cover each of the five scales, the three challenges, and your reflection. You can use text and images in a documents, and <u>make sure to include appropriate literature citations to back up</u> <u>your findings</u>. Organize your answers to the prompt in sections – i.e. one section for each of the five scales, and one section for each of the three challenges you identify.

PowerPoint Slide Deck: For your class presentation, you will have **3 minutes** to highlight your analysis with 2 PowerPoint slides: <u>one introductory slide on what your technology is, and one slide detailing two scales you found to be important and the interface challenges between them.</u> You do not need to present your reflection.

<u>Homework Grade Rubric (24 points maximum)</u>: Students will be assessed on their turned in assignment on clearly identifying and explaining biological functions within the molecular, network, cell/cell-free systems, and cellular communities scales, and including identifying potential issues at the societal scale; and three separate challenges that arise at the interfaces between three sets of scales. More points are given for more details – i.e. explaining why a



The copyright holder for this material is the author, who has made it available under a <u>CC BY-NC-SA 4.0 International license</u>.

particular function is needed for the technology, how these functions combine together within the technology, why an interface between two scales presents a particular challenge for this technology, and using details and literature citations to support your reasoning.

| Scales   | (0 pts)<br>Missing<br>Criterion is<br>missing | (1 pt)<br>Beginning<br>Little or no<br>evidence of<br>outcome  | (2pts)<br>Developing<br>Beginning of/some evidence of<br>outcome   | (3 pts)<br>Accomplished<br>Detailed and consistent<br>evidence of outcome  |
|--|---|--|--|--|
| Evidence of identifying<br>a biological function at<br>the <b>molecular scale</b><br>important for that<br>application.                    | Scale is <b>not</b><br>mentioned              | <ul> <li>Scale is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Biological<br/>function is not<br/>clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>No explanation<br/>of why the<br/>function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and<br/>function are not<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate<br/>evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is clearly articulated</li> <li>Some explanation of why the function is needed</li> <li>Scale and function are not supported with appropriate evidence from literature</li> </ul>                 | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is<br/>clearly articulated</li> <li>Detailed explanation of<br/>why the function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and function are<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature (i.e.<br/>specific molecule/cell<br/>strain name with<br/>literature reference)</li> </ul> |
| Evidence of identifying<br>a biological function at<br>the <b>network</b> scale<br>important for that<br>application.                      | Scale is <b>not</b><br>mentioned              | <ul> <li>Scale is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Biological<br/>function is not<br/>clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>No explanation<br/>of why the<br/>function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and<br/>function are not<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate<br/>evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Some explanation of why<br/>the function is needed</li> <li>Scale and function are not<br/>supported with appropriate<br/>evidence from literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is<br/>clearly articulated</li> <li>Detailed explanation of<br/>why the function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and function are<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature (i.e.<br/>specific molecule/cell<br/>strain name with<br/>literature reference)</li> </ul> |
| Evidence of identifying<br>a biological function at<br>the <b>cell/cell-free</b><br><b>system</b> scale important<br>for that application. | Scale is <b>not</b><br>mentioned              | <ul> <li>Scale is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Biological<br/>function is not<br/>clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>No explanation<br/>of why the<br/>function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and<br/>function are not<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate<br/>evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Some explanation of why<br/>the function is needed</li> <li>Scale and function are not<br/>supported with appropriate<br/>evidence from literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is<br/>clearly articulated</li> <li>Detailed explanation of<br/>why the function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and function are<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature (i.e.<br/>specific molecule/cell<br/>strain name with<br/>literature reference)</li> </ul> |
| Evidence of identifying<br>a biological function at<br>the cellular<br><b>communities</b> scale<br>important for that<br>application.      | Scale is <b>not</b><br>mentioned              | <ul> <li>Scale is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Biological<br/>function is not<br/>clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>No explanation<br/>of why the</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Some explanation of why<br/>the function is needed</li> <li>Scale and function are not<br/>supported with appropriate<br/>evidence from literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is<br/>clearly articulated</li> <li>Detailed explanation of<br/>why the function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and function are<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate evidence</li> </ul>   |



|  |                                  | function is<br>needed<br>Scale and<br>function are not<br>supported with<br>appropriate<br>evidence from<br>literature   |  | from literature (i.e.<br>specific molecule/cell<br>strain name with<br>literature reference)   |
|--|----------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Evidence of identifying<br>a challenge at the<br><b>societal</b> scale<br>important for that<br>application. | Scale is <b>not</b><br>mentioned | <ul> <li>Scale is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Biological<br/>function is not<br/>clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>No explanation<br/>of why the<br/>function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and<br/>function are not<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate<br/>evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Some explanation of why<br/>the function is needed</li> <li>Scale and function are not<br/>supported with appropriate<br/>evidence from literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Scale is mentioned</li> <li>Biological function is<br/>clearly articulated</li> <li>Detailed explanation of<br/>why the function is<br/>needed</li> <li>Scale and function are<br/>supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature (i.e.<br/>specific molecule/cell<br/>strain name with<br/>literature reference)</li> </ul> |

| Challenges   | (0 pts)<br>Missing<br>Criterion is<br>missing                | (1 pt)<br>Beginning<br>Little or no<br>evidence of<br>outcome  | (2pts)<br>Developing<br>Beginning of/some evidence of<br>outcome  | (3 pts)<br>Accomplished<br>Detailed and consistent<br>evidence of outcome   |
|--|--|--|---|---|
| Evidence of identifying<br>the <b>first</b> challenge<br>between two or more<br>scales.  | Interface<br>and<br>challenge<br>are <b>not</b><br>mentioned | <ul> <li>Interface is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is<br/>not clearly<br/>articulated</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Interface is mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Interface and challenge are<br/>not supported with<br/>appropriate evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Interface is mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Interface and challenge<br/>are supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature</li> </ul> |
| Evidence of identifying<br>the <b>second</b> challenge<br>between two or more<br>scales. | Interface<br>and<br>challenge<br>are <b>not</b><br>mentioned | <ul> <li>Interface is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is<br/>not clearly<br/>articulated</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Interface is mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Interface and challenge are<br/>not supported with<br/>appropriate evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Interface is mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Interface and challenge<br/>are supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature</li> </ul> |
| Evidence of identifying<br>the <b>third</b> challenge<br>between two or more<br>scales.  | Interface<br>and<br>challenge<br>are <b>not</b><br>mentioned | <ul> <li>Interface is<br/>mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is<br/>not clearly<br/>articulated</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Interface is mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Interface and challenge are<br/>not supported with<br/>appropriate evidence from<br/>literature</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Interface is mentioned</li> <li>Challenge is clearly<br/>articulated</li> <li>Interface and challenge<br/>are supported with<br/>appropriate evidence<br/>from literature</li> </ul> |

<u>Presentation Grade Rubric:</u> Everyone is expected to present. Full credit (7.5%) given for presenting in class, no credit (0%) given for not presenting.



<u>Instructor Notes (not distributed)</u>: When introducing this assignment, emphasize that it builds off of Assignment 1, but to now use the scales framework discussed in class to revisit your thinking.

## **Evaluation Process:**

- 1. TA and instructor will compare a few samples of student work, deciding on ratings. After they have reached agreement, they will score the rest of the student work separately.
- 2. TA and instructor will compare ratings and discuss any points of disagreement.
- 3. TA and instructor will record all rubric scores in spreadsheet.
- 4. Internal evaluator will put into master spreadsheet to examine points of change between assignment 1 responses and assignment 2 responses.

